

Plenary

Meeting date:
Tuesday, 19 March 2013

Meeting time:
13:00

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Votes and Proceedings

(121)

Personal Statement – Bethan Jenkins

Bethan Jenkins made a personal statement.

1. Questions to the First Minister

The item started at 13.01

All 15 questions were asked. Questions 1, 2 and 11 were grouped together for answer and questions 5 and 6 were grouped together for answer. The Presiding Officer invited party leaders to ask questions to the First Minister after Question 2.

2. Questions to the Minister for Natural Resources and Food – moved from 20 March 2013

The item started at 13.50

Questions 1 – 7 and 9 – 15 were asked. Question 8 was withdrawn.

3. Questions to the Minister for Housing and Regeneration – moved from 20 March 2013

The item started at 14.28

Questions 1 – 4 and 6 – 12 were asked. Question 1 and 12 were grouped together for answer and questions 3, 11 and 8 were grouped for answer. Question 5 was withdrawn. The remaining questions 13 – 15 were asked following the Business Statement and Announcement.

4. Business Statement and Announcement

The item started at 15.02

Point of Order

A Point of Order was raised by Peter Black in respect of the answers given by Ministers during Oral Questions on portfolios which were new to them and the impact this had on Members' ability to scrutinise Ministers. He requested that the Presiding Officer, the Minister for Government Business and the Business Committee reviewed the matter. The Presiding Officer ruled that when Members tabled their questions, they would have expected to receive a substantive answer from the responsible Minister as usual. She reminded Members however, that Ministers are responsible for their own replies and that Ministers had taken a pragmatic approach in answering these oral questions following the changes.

Motion to elect a Member to Business Committee

NNDM5196 Rosemary Butler (Newport West)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.14, elects Lesley Griffiths (Welsh Labour) as a member of the Business Committee in place of Jane Hutt (Welsh Labour).

The motion was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

5. Natural Resources Body for Wales (Functions) Order 2013

The item started at 15.19

Voting on the motion under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

NDM5191 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales; in accordance with Standing Order 27.5

Approves that the draft The Natural Resources Body for Wales (Functions) Order 2013 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 26 February 2013. The result was as follows:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
41	0	11	52

The motion was agreed.

6. Debate: The Estyn Annual Report 2011–12

The item started at 15.40

NDM5189 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the annual report for 2011–12 of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales.

The following amendments were tabled:

Amendment 1 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Notes in particular the conclusion of the Chief Inspector that 'attendance remains the weakest aspect of wellbeing for schools'.

Amendment 1 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Amendment 2 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Notes the need, identified by the Chief Inspector, for more support for teachers in delivering improvements in standards.

Amendment 2 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Amendment 3 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to intensify its focus on sharing best practice in education on breaking the cycle of poverty and disadvantage in schools.

Amendment 3 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Amendment 4 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Regrets the findings within the report that the proportion of schools inspected in 2011–12 that were judged excellent or good was lower than the previous year, with more secondary schools at the extremes of excellent or unsatisfactory performance.

Amendment 4 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Voting on the motion and the remaining amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

Amendment 5 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to review guidance issued to schools to ensure the Pupil Deprivation Grant is used to effectively target the high absenteeism rates of pupils on free school meals, to maximise the achievement levels of pupils from poorer backgrounds.

A vote was taken on Amendment 5:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
14	11	28	53

Amendment 5 was not agreed.

Amendment 6 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Estyn reports on how effectively the Pupil Deprivation Grant is being used by schools to narrow the attainment gap between pupils from disadvantaged and more affluent backgrounds.

A vote was taken on Amendment 6:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
32	20	0	52

Amendment 6 was agreed.

Amendment 7 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Expresses concern that 54% of secondary schools and 48% of primary schools have been identified for follow up visits, which is an increase on last year.

A vote was taken on Amendment 7:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
53	0	0	53

Amendment 7 was agreed.

Amendment 8 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to establish national targets and benchmarks to monitor the progress being made to tackle the gap between deprivation and attainment.

A vote was taken on Amendment 8:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
16	10	28	54

Amendment 8 was not agreed.

Amendment 9 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets that 'more able and talented pupils achieve less well in Wales than in England', according to the report.

A vote was taken on Amendment 9:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
26	0	28	54

Amendment 9 was not agreed.

Amendment 10 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Expresses deep concern that there is a need to achieve better literacy standards in over half of Wales' primary and secondary schools, according to the report.

A vote was taken on Amendment 10:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
26	0	28	54

Amendment 10 was not agreed.

Amendment 11 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Regrets Estyn's findings which suggest the existence of 'mediocre teaching performance'.

A vote was taken on Amendment 11:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
39	0	14	53

Amendment 11 was agreed.

Amendment 12 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Urges the Minister to explain what influence Welsh Government officials exerted on this report from an independent arm's length body

A vote was taken on Amendment 12:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
11	0	43	54

Amendment 12 was not agreed.

Amendment 13 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to undertake urgent action to address the failings in the Welsh educational system identified by Estyn.

A vote was taken on Amendment 13:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
17	0	37	54

Amendment 13 was not agreed.

A vote was taken on the motion as amended:

NDM5189 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the annual report for 2011–12 of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales.

Notes in particular the conclusion of the Chief Inspector that 'attendance remains the weakest aspect of wellbeing for schools'.

Notes the need, identified by the Chief Inspector, for more support for teachers in delivering improvements in standards.

Calls on the Welsh Government to intensify its focus on sharing best practice in education on breaking the cycle of poverty and disadvantage in schools.

Regrets the findings within the report that the proportion of schools inspected in 2011–12 that were judged excellent or good was lower than the previous year, with more secondary schools at the extremes of excellent or unsatisfactory performance.

Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Estyn reports on how effectively the Pupil Deprivation Grant is being used by schools to narrow the attainment gap between pupils from disadvantaged and more affluent backgrounds.

Expresses concern that 54% of secondary schools and 48% of primary schools have been identified for follow up visits, which is an increase on last year.

Regrets Estyn's findings which suggest the existence of 'mediocre teaching performance'.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
43	11	0	54

The motion as amended was agreed.

7. Debate: The Patients' Voice – Strengthening the Role of Community Health Councils

The item started at 16.24

Voting on the motion and amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

NDM5193 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the proposals of the Welsh Government to transform, strengthen and empower Community Health Councils to undertake their role in the 21st Century NHS.

The following amendments were tabled:

Amendment 1 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Delete 'to transform, strengthen and empower Community Health Councils' and insert 'for Community Health Councils to assist them'

A vote was taken on Amendment 1:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
-----	---------	---------	-------

21	5	28	54
----	---	----	----

Amendment 1 was not agreed.

Amendment 2 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Believes that members of the Board of Community Health Councils are best placed to appoint their Chair, rather than Welsh Ministers.

A vote was taken on Amendment 2:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
16	1	37	54

Amendment 2 was not agreed.

Amendment 3 – William Graham (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to clarify guidance on the role of Community Health Councils in providing the ‘patients’ voice’ in the process of service reconfiguration.

A vote was taken on Amendment 3:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
26	0	28	54

Amendment 3 was not agreed.

Amendment 4 – Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Community Health Councils are an independent voice for patients.

A vote was taken on Amendment 4:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
54	0	0	54

Amendment 4 was agreed.

Amendment 5 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Believes that Community Health Councils must play a vital role in providing a strong voice for patients and the public and calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Community Health Councils have the funding and training needed to engage effectively in the future reorganisation of NHS Wales.

A vote was taken on Amendment 5:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
54	0	0	54

Amendment 5 was agreed.

Amendment 6 – Aled Roberts (North Wales)

Add new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to adopt National Standards on Community Engagement, based on the Scottish model, to improve the role of Community Health Councils in ensuring that the views of the public are properly taken into account in the future decisions about our NHS.

A vote was taken on Amendment 6:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
15	0	39	54

Amendment 6 was not agreed.

A vote was taken on the motion as amended:

NDM5193 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the proposals of the Welsh Government to transform, strengthen and empower Community Health Councils to undertake their role in the 21st Century NHS.

Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Community Health Councils are an independent voice for patients.

Believes that Community Health Councils must play a vital role in providing a strong voice for patients and the public and calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that Community Health Councils have the funding and training needed to engage effectively in the future reorganisation of NHS Wales.

For	Abstain	Against	Total
-----	---------	---------	-------

43	11	0	54
----	----	---	----

The motion as amended was agreed.

8. Stage 1 Debate on the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill – moved from 20 March 2013

The item started at 17.15

Voting on the motion under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

NDM5192 Mick Antoniw (Pontypridd)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with Standing Order 26.11:

Agrees to the general principles of the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill.

The Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill and Explanatory Memorandum were laid before the Assembly on 3 December 2012.

The report of the Health and Social Care Committee on the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill was laid before the Assembly on 7 March 2013.

The result was as follows:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
43	0	11	54

The motion was agreed.

9. Financial Resolution on the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill – moved from 20 March 2013

The item started at 18.11

Voting on the motion under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

NDM5190 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, for the purposes of any provisions resulting from the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill, agrees to any increase in expenditure of a kind referred to in Standing Order 26.69(ii), arising in consequence of the Bill.

The result was as follows:

For	Abstain	Against	Total
43	0	11	54

The motion was agreed.

Voting Time

The item started at 18.12

The meeting concluded at 18:21

The Assembly will sit again in Plenary at 13:30, Wednesday, 20 March 2013